

**California Regional Water Quality Control Board
San Diego Region**

Response to Comments Report

**Tentative Order No. R9-2015-0117
NPDES No. CA0109185**

***Waste Discharge Requirements for the
United States Department of the Navy
Naval Base Coronado
San Diego County***

November 18, 2015

**CALIFORNIA REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD
SAN DIEGO REGION**

2375 Northside Drive, Suite 100, San Diego, California 92108
Phone • (619) 516-1990 • Fax (619) 516-1994
<http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/sandiego>

Documents are available at: <http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/sandiego>

**California Regional Water Quality Control Board
San Diego Region**

Henry Abarbanel, *Chair*
Gary Strawn, *Vice Chair*
Eric Anderson
Tomás Morales
Stefanie Warren
Betty Olsen
Vacant

David W. Gibson, *Executive Officer*
James G. Smith, *Assistant Executive Officer*

Catherine Hagan, *Senior Staff Counsel, Office of Chief Counsel*
Adriana Nunez, *Staff Counsel, Office of Chief Counsel*

This report was prepared under the direction of

David T. Barker, P.E., *Supervising Water Resource Control Engineer,
Surface Water Basins Branch*
Brandi N. Outwin-Beals, P.E., *Senior Water Resources Control Engineer,
Source Control Regulation Unit*

By

Kristin K. Schwall, P.E., *Water Resource Control Engineer*

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

Introduction

The California Regional Water Quality Control Board, San Diego Region (San Diego Water Board) has prepared this Response to Comments Report on Tentative Order No. R9-2015-0117, NPDES No. CA0109185, United States Department of the Navy, Naval Base Coronado (Tentative Order). The Tentative Order was available for public review and comment for 31 days, with the comment period ending on October 12, 2015.

Written comments were received from:	Page No.
U.S. Department of the Navy (Navy)	1

Comments and Responses

The summarized written comments and San Diego Water Board responses to the comments are listed in the table that follows. The comments are organized according to the party that made the comment. The table indicates if the Tentative Order was revised in response to the comment.

No.	Comment	Response	Action Taken
Len Sinfield; Water Quality Program Manager; Navy (Discharger)			
1	New Installation Environmental Program Director is Mr. Jason Golumbfskie	Table 1 and Table F-1 of the Tentative Order has been revised to reflect the current personnel at the time of adoption.	This change has been made to the Tentative Order.
2	Section VI.A.2.b has an expiration date of January 31, 2021. Table 3 on page 3 indicates that the expiration date of the permit is December 31, 2020.	The Tentative Order has been revised to correct the expiration date.	This change has been made to the Tentative Order.
3	The value of the “Percent Effect” should be revised from 0.5 to 50 – the proportion is listed rather than the percent value: The Maximum Daily Effluent Limitation (MDEL) for chronic toxicity is exceeded and a violation will be flagged when a chronic toxicity test, analyzed using the TST statistical approach, results in “Fail” and the “Percent Effect” is ≥50.	The San Diego Water Board agrees that percent effect should be revised from 0.50 to 50 percent throughout the Tentative Order. In addition, the percent effect expressed as decimals has been changed to numerical percentage in sections IV.B.5, IV.D and IV.E of the Fact Sheet.	This change has been made to the Tentative Order.
4	<p>The text in section VII.J of the Tentative Order should be revised as follows for clarity:</p> <p>Median Monthly Effluent Limitation (MMEL) for chronic toxicity is exceeded and a violation will be flagged when the median of no more than three independent chronic toxicity tests, conducted within the same calendar month and analyzed using the TST statistical approach, results in “Fail” <u>with a percent effect of ≥ 50 at the IWC.</u></p>	<p>The requested revision is not consistent with guidance from the State Water Resources Control Board and U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA). The MMEL does not use the percent effect. The percent effect is only used with the Maximum Daily Effluent Limitation. For clarification the language quoted in the Navy’s comment from section VII.J of the Tentative Order has been changed to the following: <u>The Median Monthly Effluent Limitation (MMEL) for chronic toxicity is exceeded and a violation will be flagged when the median results of three independent toxicity tests, conducted within the same calendar month, and analyzed using the TST, (i.e. 2 out of 3) is a “fail.”</u></p>	The definition of MMEL has been clarified in the Tentative Order.

No.	Comment	Response	Action Taken
5	<p>The text in section VII.J of the Tentative Order should be revised as follows for clarity:</p> <p>The chronic toxicity MDEL and MMEL are set at the IWC for the discharge (100% effluent) and expressed in units of the TST statistical approach (“Pass” or “Fail,” “Percent Effect”). All NPDES effluent compliance monitoring for the chronic toxicity MDEL and MMEL shall be reported using the 100% effluent concentration and negative control, expressed in units of <u>using the TST outcome and percent effect.</u></p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and section VII.J of the Tentative Order has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>
6	<p>We recommend that the method for assessing the purple sea urchin be changed from the “Fertilization Test Method” to the “Embryo-larval Development Test Method” as required in the Naval Based San Diego (NBSD) NPDES Permit (Order No. R9-2013-0064). The Embryo-larval Development Test is recommended over the egg fertilization endpoint method because this procedure includes a longer exposure period and thus more cellular changes and processes than fertilization alone. The outcome of the embryo development test is also less dependent on seasonal variations in sperm motility and technician-specific techniques.</p>	<p>Based on consultation with USEPA, the San Diego Water Board agrees that the Navy may use the purple sea urchin, <i>S. purpuratus</i>, or sand dollar, <i>Dendraster excentricus</i>, 48-hour non-renewal Larval Development Test for evaluating chronic toxicity. This method has been added as an alternate method in the Tentative Order.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>

No.	Comment	Response	Action Taken
7	<p>The text in section IV.3 of Attachment E to the Tentative Order should be revised as follows for clarity:</p> <p>The MDEL for chronic toxicity is exceeded and a violation will be flagged when a toxicity test during monitoring results in a “Fail” in accordance with the TST approach and the percent_effect <u>relative to a control</u> is <u>≥ 50</u>.</p> <p>Note: the percent effect should be 50%, not 0.50%.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and section IV.C.5.a of the Fact Sheet has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>
8	<p>The text in section V and table E-5 of Attachment E of the Tentative Order should be revised as follows for clarity:</p> <p>Pollutants and Frequency: “The Sampling and Analysis Plan shall propose the pollutants to be monitored, and the frequency and timing for water column sampling <u>to be performed in San Diego Bay</u>. At a minimum, monitoring shall include the pollutants and frequency in Table E 5 below. The proposed sampling shall be based upon results on the fate and transport of pollutants from the conceptual model (see V.C.5 below).”</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and Table E-5 has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>

No.	Comment	Response	Action Taken
9	<p>The text in Table E-6 and E-7 of Attachment E to the Tentative Order should be revised as follows for clarity:</p> <p>After four consecutive sampling events where parameters are not detected or are below the Annual NAL values, analysis for those parameters may be discontinued <u>at any affected outfall</u>.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and Tables E-6 and E-7 have been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>
10	<p>Remote Training Site Warner Springs (RTSWS), Camp Michael Monsoor, and Camp Morena are small, remote training facilities. According to 2010 Census Maps, all are located over 10 miles away from the nearest urbanized area. Phase II MS4 rule requirements are intended to regulate discharges of storm water in urbanized areas.</p> <p>Please revise the permit to clarify that Naval Base Coronado is not required to implement Small MS4 requirements in training areas and other areas outside of urbanized areas.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees that these are small installations, but the RTSWS is in a watershed with a Total Maximum Daily Load (TMDL) for bacteria so a Storm Water Management Plan (SWMP) will need to be developed for this installation to comply with the TMDL. Language has been added to the Tentative Order to require annual assessments of Camp Michael Monsoor and Camp Morena to determine if Phase II MS4 requirements apply.</p>	<p>Changes have been made to the Tentative Order to address this comment.</p>

No.	Comment	Response	Action Taken
11	<p>The reference to Section IV.E.2 appears to be incorrect in that it applies industrial SWPPP requirements.</p> <p>Section IV.D.2 applies to Small MS4 Discharge Specifications.</p> <p>We need to discuss and obtain clarification from the Board.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board has revised the section reference in the Tentative Order, as requested. The current order, Order No. R9-2009-0081, established 57 outfalls at Naval Air Station North Island, 51 outfalls at Naval Amphibious Base, and 4 outfalls at Naval Outlying Landing Field as discharging industrial storm water. A Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) was required for the associated outfalls. The Tentative Order requires the Discharger to maintain the SWPPP at any outfalls that have been designated in the Tentative Order as Municipal storm water which were Industrial storm water under Order No. R9-2009-0081. The SWPPP is to be maintained until the SWMP for the Municipal Separate Storm Sewer System (MS4) is implemented so that BMPs are continuously employed as necessary to protect water quality.</p>	<p>The reference on page G-1 of the Tentative Order has been corrected.</p>
12	<p>The Navy is currently reviewing Table M-1 in Attachment M to the Tentative Order and additional comments may be pending.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board discussed this comment with the Navy and an agreement was reached to finalize the storm water risk level designations after the permit is adopted. Although the Tentative Order contains an initial storm water risk level designation, storm water risk levels are evaluated on an ongoing basis and an Annual Storm Water Risk Level Designation Report is due September 1 of each year. Because the new storm water sampling requirements begin on July 1, 2016 storm water risk levels can be assessed and re-designated after adoption of the permit.</p>	<p>No changes have been made to the Tentative Order.</p>

No.	Comment	Response	Action Taken
	<p>Typographical error in section III.I: Discharges to Waters of the U.S., including but not limited to San Diego Bay, the Pacific Ocean, and the Tijuana River Estuary, containing a hazardous substance equal to or in excess of a reportable quantity listed in 40 CFR part 117, Security Classification Regulations Pursuant To Executive Order 11652, and/or <u>40</u> CFR part 302, Designation, Reportable Quantities, and Notification, are prohibited</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and section III.I of the Tentative Order has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>
	<p>VI.C.2.a The Discharger may, at their discretion, propose a work plan for a detailed study to support a Basin Plan Amendment....</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and section VI.C.2.a of the Tentative Order has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>
	<p>II.B.1.b of Attachment F This Order establishes requirements for the discharge of storm water runoff from “Industrial High Risk Areas,” which are defined in section IV.B.1 of this Order as “All areas where wastes or pollutants of significant quantities form<u>from</u> ship construction”.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and section II.B.1.b of the Fact Sheet has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>
	<p>Please revise Navy ID Numbers written as “NANSI” to “NASNI” in Attachment M.</p>	<p>The San Diego Water Board agrees and Attachment M has been revised as requested.</p>	<p>This change has been made to the Tentative Order.</p>