

## City of Eureka

*The City of Eureka (hereinafter Discharger) submitted comments on the draft NPDES permit (Order No. R1-2009-0033) on April 23, 2009. The comments identified errata, requested clarification, or requested minor changes to the draft Order. The following are staff responses to significant comments from the Discharger:*

**Comment 1: Total Chlorine Residual.** On page F-34 item B. Effluent Monitoring the second bullet item states:

*The required method detection limit for total residual chlorine has been lowered by the MRP from 0.1 mg/L, which was required by the previous permit, to 0.05 mg/L, to be consistent with other recently adopted permits in the Region.*

The City respectfully objects to this proposed permit modification based on the justification that it will be consistent with other recently adopted permits. I would like to remind you that the outfall 001 is considered an ocean discharge with a 30 to 1 dilution at the initial mixing zone and that Eureka's current limit is below or consistent with other ocean outfall plants in the region such as Crescent City and Fort Bragg. Crescent City's chlorine limit is 0.24 mg/L daily maximum and Fort Bragg's chlorine limit is 0.1 mg/L daily maximum. In conversations with City of Fort Bragg staff, it is our understanding their proposed revised NPDES permit includes a recommended chlorine MDL of 0.1 mg/L daily maximum and that permit will be considered by the Regional Board before the City of Eureka permit.

Leaving the City of Eureka maximum residual chlorine limit at 0.1 mg/L will result in the City of Eureka and Fort Bragg having the same chlorine residual limit for ocean discharge. Please accept our concern and revise this requirement. We will be happy to provide you with any additional information requested.

**Response:** The statement on page F-34, Item B, of the Fact Sheet is inaccurate to the extent that method detection limits for total chlorine residual should be consistent from permittee to permittee. More correctly, the method detection limits specified in a permit must be appropriate to demonstrate compliance with effluent limitations or water quality objectives and must conform to federal regulations in 40 CFR Part 136. Because effluent limitations are discharge-specific, the detection method necessary for compliance purposes may be different from permittee to permittee. The larger issue for this permit is whether an effluent limitation of nondetect is appropriate and justified.

Upon review, it has been determined that the effluent limitation for total chlorine residual contained in the Discharger's existing permit was mistakenly applied to the ocean discharge at outfall 001. The review indicated that, until established in WDR Order No. R1-2004-0013, the effluent limitation of nondetect for total chlorine residual applied only to discharges to the Wildlife Management Area. Water quality-based effluent limitations for total chlorine residual, in order to meet ocean water

quality objectives, are properly calculated in accordance with procedures in the 2005 Ocean Plan. The requirement in the previous permit for the discharge to have no detectable chlorine residual was overly stringent and was not consistent with the Ocean Plan. Accordingly, the draft Order has been revised to establish water quality based effluent limitations for total chlorine residual that are calculated pursuant to procedures contained in the 2005 Ocean Plan, as follows:

Parameter	Units	Effluent Limitations		
		Maximum Daily	Instantaneous Maximum	6-month median
Total Chlorine Residual	µg/L	248	1,860	62
flows up to 8.6 mgd	lbs/day	17.8	133.4	4.45
flows greater than 8.6 mgd	lbs/day	24.8	186	6.20

The revised draft Monitoring and Reporting Program does not specify a minimum method detection limit for discharges to outfall 001; it requires the Discharger to monitor total residual chlorine in the effluent continuously using a method, authorized by 40 CFR 136, with a reporting limit as low as technically feasible in order to demonstrate compliance with a daily maximum chlorine residual effluent limit of 0.248 mg/L and a six month median limit of 0.062 mg/L.